

Published December 20, 2022

Position Statements on Priority Areas to Support the Sustainability of the Canadian Rheumatology Workforce

A sustainable rheumatology workforce is essential to achieve the mission of the Canadian Rheumatology Association (CRA), Most importantly, a sustainable rheumatology workforce is necessary to meet Canada's population health needs, and to address the priorities of better access, better health, better care experience, and reduced costs.

Rheumatic and musculoskeletal diseases (RMDs) are a leading cause of disability worldwide and cause significant economic and societal burdens internationally and in Canada. There is significant evidence to demonstrate that early diagnosis and targeted treatment guided by a rheumatologist improves long-term patient outcomes and reduces costs to the health care system when compared to outcomes for patients who do not have access to specialist rheumatology care (5, 6). Therefore, careful planning for the future is important to ensure there are adequate resources to provide the necessary specialty care to Canadians living with RMDs.

An essential component in ensuring sustainability of the rheumatology workforce is to establish and maintain sufficient capacity at the postgraduate training level. Choice of practice discipline as a lifelong career can be one of the most difficult aspects of physician training. Exacerbating this challenge are the vast array of available specialties, timing of choices, as well as practice considerations in terms of lifestyle and physician resource needs.

Given the aging Canadian population and the high prevalence of RMDs and RMD related disability in the country, there is significant interest to better understand rheumatology workforce requirements and projections in order to inform policies at the national and regional levels.

To speak with a unified and cohesive voice, the CRA has developed and endorsed 6 position statements to help prioritize and inform strategies, policies, programs, and funding to help protect the sustainability of Canada's rheumatology workforce. This was done by reviewing, synthesizing and analyzing current data and literature on Canada's rheumatology workforce. The position statements and accompanying strategies are not intended to be exhaustive, prescriptive, or authoritative. The intention of this report is to illuminate, educate, stimulate, and encourage meaningful discussion to further efforts to strengthen Canada's rheumatology workforce.



The CRA holds the following positions on priorities to strengthen the Rheumatology Workforce in Canada:

- 1. Increase Recruitment (& training) of Clinical Full-time Equivalent (FTE) Rheumatologists.
- 2. Improve the Regional Distribution of Rheumatology Care across Canada.
- 3. Enhance Retention of Rheumatologists within the Workforce.
- 4. Promote Workforce Capacity with Interdisciplinary Health Providers
- 5. Promote and Support Research to Provide Data About the Rheumatology Workforce to Plan for the Future Health Care Needs of Canada's Population.
- 6. Support Equity, Diversity, & Inclusion in Rheumatology.

Recommendations

Recommendation # 1: Increase recruitment/training of clinical FTE (Full-Time Equivalent) rheumatologists.

Although the rheumatology workforce has been growing over time, the growth is insufficient due to population growth, increasing patient demands for services among an aging patient demographic, and demographic changes to the workforce, the latter of which is changing the workforce capacity. Increasing feminization, generational effects, a large volume of impending retirements, and other factors are contributing to lower service capacity amongst rheumatologists than previous years. There are deficits in the total number of rheumatologists in Canada without taking into account that there are fewer clinical FTEs than the absolute number of practicing rheumatologists. While the true deficit has not fully been quantified, immediate efforts to expand recruitment/training of clinical FTEs are needed considering the lag time required to train new rheumatologists. Recommended strategies include the following:

 Recruitment of new rheumatologists by improving rheumatology exposure in medical school.



- 2. Recruitment of new rheumatologists by increasing rheumatology residency spots and reducing residency vacancies.
- 3. Recruitment of new rheumatologists by making rheumatology more attractive.
- 4. Enhance recruitment of international medical graduates (IMGs).

Recommendation # 2: Improve the Regional Distribution Of Rheumatologists Across Canada

The geography in Canada creates challenges for the delivery of rheumatology care services to Canadians living in rural and remote communities. Canadians living in rural areas comprise 18% of the population (12) yet the majority of rheumatology practices congregate in urban centres and a minority participate in travelling clinics to remote areas. Consequently, rural, and remote communities lack access to rheumatologists and face long travel distances to rheumatology care. Considering that RMDs often impair mobility which hampers their ability to participate in society and in seeking medical care, barriers to rheumatology care need to be understood using an ethical paradigm by bringing care to these regions (versus patients travelling long distances to seek care). Targeted efforts with committed government policy and funding are necessary to address these unique needs of these communities. Recommended strategies include the following:

- 1. Medical schools/training programs should screen for interest in rural medicine, rural origins, family currently living in rural community.
- 2. There is a need to monitor practice locations and practice scope of graduates of rheumatology residency programs.
- 3. Return-of-service agreements, bursaries, scholarships and other financial incentives should be available to rheumatologists to provide service to underserved areas.
- 4. Ensure fair incentives are provided to locum rheumatologists to travel to provide services to underserviced areas.
- 5. Funding to support telehealth in rural or underserviced areas to deliver and assist with the delivery of rheumatology services.
- 6. Medical schools with undergraduate and graduate rheumatology specialty programs should promote and require training rotations in communities outside of urban academic centres.
- 7. Rheumatology specialty programs should provide formal training in alternative models of care to underserviced, rural and remote areas.
- 8. Recruit IMGs for underserviced communities.
- 9. Identify and advertise priority areas in Canada that lack rheumatologists.
- 10. Increase the number of rheumatologists participating in telemedicine/virtual care to underserviced areas.
- 11. Provincial governments should not impose barriers for rheumatologists providing telehealth services to out-of-province Canadian residents.



Recommendation # 3: Enhance Retention Of Rheumatologists Within The Workforce

Rheumatology supply is the product of a dynamic interplay between the production of new rheumatologists, and attrition of existing rheumatologists – either temporarily or permanently – from the workforce. Rheumatologists may temporarily leave practice because of parental leave, illness, sabbaticals, and/or disability. They also leave the workforce entirely due to retirement or career changes. Strategies to retain rheumatologists within the workforce are therefore important to prevent further deficits in supply. A sustainable rheumatology workforce requires support for providing coverage for temporary departures, and support for established rheumatologists to avert leaving clinical practice prematurely. Canada's rheumatology workforce faces a large number of impending retirements, and there are benefits of retaining older rheumatologists by adjusting workloads over an abrupt termination of services. Recommended strategies include the following:

- 1. Provide better parental leave programs.
- 2. Provide support to late-stage career rheumatologists to enable a gradual transition out of the clinical workforce.
- 3. Monitor retirement planning.
- 4. Monitor workforce wellness and provide comprehensive wellness and mental health resources and supports.
- 5. Develop strategies and provide supports to IMG rheumatologists.
- 6. Develop strategies and provide supports to rheumatologists practicing in remote areas.

Recommendation # 4: Promote and Enhance Workforce Capacity with Interdisciplinary Health Providers

To deliver optimal care and treatment to patients, and make maximum use of rheumatologists' time, rheumatologists benefit from the support of rheumatology-trained nurses, occupational therapists, social workers, physiotherapists and other interdisciplinary health providers (IHPs). With rare exceptions, there is no specific funding allocated for physiotherapists, occupational therapists, nurse practitioners (NPs), and physician assistants (PAs), administrative overhead, and nursing, essential to supporting rheumatologists in the care of people with RMDs. In order to support a sustainable rheumatology workforce, a competent health workforce requires support in implementing effective models of care (13). Clinical service capacity is most likely to be increased by models of care that integrate the work of multidisciplinary teams thereby shifting workflow, responsibilities and access to programs. In such service delivery models, the skillsets of advanced practice or extended role practitioners (ERPs) may be leveraged with medical directives or authorized activities in place. Therefore, the CRA supports the need to expand rheumatology workforce capacity by incorporating well-trained IHPs. Recommended strategies include the following:



- 1. Advocate for provincial governments to provide funding for interdisciplinary health providers with extra training in arthritis care to assist rheumatologists in the delivery of outpatient care.
- 2. Support and fund training of interdisciplinary health providers.
- Rheumatology training programs need to ensure that there is adequate exposure to alternate models of rheumatology health care delivery to encourage future implementation of models of care that integrate IHPs.

Recommendation # 5: Promote and Support Research To Provide Data About The Rheumatology Workforce To Plan For The Future Health Care Needs Of Canada's Population.

Major gaps exist in currently available data on the current and future rheumatology workforce in Canada. The question of how many rheumatologists should be trained in order to meet future population needs must be addressed by studies modeling the need and demand for, and supply of rheumatologists to provide health planners, rheumatology societies, universities, health care funders, and policy makers with workforce targets. Recommended strategies include the following:

- Advocacy directed towards governments and research funding agencies to appreciate the research gaps surrounding workforce planning and the need to adjust their funding opportunities and activities accordingly.
- 2. Develop realistic, scientifically sound workforce models for pediatric and adult rheumatology care.
- 3. Enhance dissemination of rheumatology workforce research to inform policy decision-making.
- 4. Support research on the apparent disparities impacting rheumatologists (e.g. by gender).
- 5. Support research on models of care that enhance rheumatology clinical workforce capacity.
- 6. Support research on defining clinical Full-Time Equivalent (FTE) measure(s) for rheumatology.
- 7. Develop/adapt a rheumatology conceptual and analytical framework to build capacity for research, research use, strategic planning, evaluation and knowledge translation for the development of improvement of human resources for health.

Recommendation # 6: Support Equity, Diversity, & Inclusion In Rheumatology

It is well recognized that bias and discrimination exist within all areas of society, including medical professions and healthcare. A more equitable and diverse medical profession reduces the bias and discrimination experienced by those practising within it and improves their health and wellness. Evidence shows that physicians experience greater career satisfaction and a greater sense of solidarity with their profession while patients experience improved care and a



more responsive and adaptable health care system. Concrete steps must be taken to eliminate bias and discrimination and create opportunities for all. Recommended strategies include the following:

- Take actions for closing the gap (24) including anti-oppression training; challenging the hidden curriculum in medical education; fair and transparent hiring and referral processes; changing the relative value of fee codes and transparent reporting of physician payments stratified by gender; promoting women for leadership positions; and ensuring balanced representation on journal editorial boards, journal authorship positions, speaker invitations at medical conferences, and grant and personnel award success rates.
- 2. Support efforts to further study and identify all inequities (and developing strategies for overcoming these), including the intersectionality between gender and ethnicity within the principles of equity, diversity and inclusion.
- 3. Support efforts to recruit and train fellows from underrepresented communities and equity-deserving groups.

In summary:

Lack of access to early diagnosis and treatment is perhaps one of the main access barriers faced by people with RMDs in achieving high-quality care. Therefore, the endorsed recommendations in this position paper are directed at supporting the overarching principle that all patients with suspected systemic RMDs should be referred to rheumatology care as soon as possible to confirm the diagnosis and determine the optimal course of follow-up care. Ensuring a sustainable rheumatology workforce is the foundation to ensuring the population's health needs are being met.

Taking action on 'upstream' investments in health systems that focus on health promotion and health protection have been shown to result in decreased demand for and the utilization of 'downstream' acute care health facility-based services and reduces health care expenditures over the long term (53). Historically, Canada has been slow to invest in health human resource planning (54). However concrete steps are urgently needed to strengthen Canada's rheumatology workforce. The CRA's recommendations on enhancing the sustainability of Canada's rheumatology workforce were developed to help accelerate health human resource planning activities. The recommendations target ways to improve the number and distribution of rheumatologists and overall rheumatology workforce capacity. The strategies identified provide important considerations where further efforts should be directed for developing, testing, and implementing sound policies and programs. Implementation of these recommendations and strategies will help to achieve the crucial aim of improving access to rheumatology care and early diagnosis and treatment of RMDs, as well as strengthening the workforce at large.



Full Report available at CRA Workforce Position Paper. Final.docx

This report was prepared by the CRA Human Resources Committee and made possible through the hard work of a large group of dedicated people. Their valuable input in compiling the information is gratefully acknowledged. A special thank you to Drs. Jessica Widdifield and Claire Barber for leading this important work.

References

- 1. Al Maini M, Adelowo F, Al Saleh J, Al Weshahi Y, Burmester GR, Cutolo M, Flood J, March L, McDonald-Blumer H, Pile K, Pineda C, Thorne C, Kvien TK. 2015. The global challenges and opportunities in the practice of rheumatology: white paper by the World Forum on Rheumatic and Musculoskeletal Diseases. *Clinical Rheumatology* 34: 819-29
- 2. Arthritis Alliance of Canada. 2011. The Impact of Arthritis in Canada: Today and Over the Next 30 Years
- 3. American College of Rheumatology. 2013. *Rheumatic diseases in America: The problem. The impact. the Answers.*
- 4. Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons Canada. 2019. Rheumatology Competencies.
- 5. Albrecht K, Callhoff J, Zink A. 2019. Long-term trends in rheumatology care: Achievements and deficits in 25 years of the German national rheumatology database. *Zeitschrift fur Rheumatologie*
- 6. van der Linden MP, le Cessie S, Raza K, van der Woude D, Knevel R, Huizinga TW, van der Helm-van Mil AH. 2010. Long-term impact of delay in assessment of patients with early arthritis. *Arthritis Rheum* 62: 3537-46
- 7. Liddy C, Arbab-Tafti S, Moroz I, Keely E. 2017. Primary care physician referral patterns in Ontario, Canada: a descriptive analysis of self-reported referral data. *BMC Fam Pract* 18: 81
- 8. Jaakkimainen L, Glazier R, Barnsley J, Salkeld E, Lu H, Tu K. 2014. Waiting to see the specialist: patient and provider characteristics of wait times from primary to specialty care. *BMC Fam Pract* 15: 16
- 9. Shadd J, Ryan BL, Maddocks H, Thind A. 2011. Patterns of referral in a Canadian primary care electronic health record database: retrospective cross-sectional analysis. *Inform Prim Care* 19: 217-23
- 10. Barber CE, Marshall DA, Mosher DP, Akhavan P, Tucker L, Houghton K, Batthish M, Levy DM, Schmeling H, Ellsworth J, Tibollo H, Grant S, Khodyakov D, Lacaille D, Arthritis Alliance of Canada Performance Measurement Development P. 2016. Development of System-level Performance Measures for Evaluation of Models of Care for Inflammatory Arthritis in Canada. *J Rheumatol* 43: 530-40
- 11. Widdifield J BS, Thorne JC, Bombardier C, Jaakkimainen RL, Wing L, Paterson JM, Ivers N, Butt D, Lyddiatt A, Hofstetter C, Ahluwalia V, Tu K. 2016. Wait times to rheumatology care for patients with rheumatic diseases: a data linkage study of primary care electronic medical records and administrative data. *CMAJ Open* 4: E205-12
- 12. CollegeofFamilyPhysiciansofCanada. 2017. Rural road map for action: directions, Mississauga (ON)
- 13. Chehade MJ, Gill TK, Kopansky-Giles D, Schuwirth L, Karnon J, McLiesh P, Alleyne J, Woolf AD. 2016. Building multidisciplinary health workforce capacity to support the implementation of integrated, people-centred Models of Care for musculoskeletal health. *Best Pract Res Clin Rheumatol* 30: 559-84
- 14. Solomon DH, Fraenkel L, Lu B, Brown E, Tsao P, Losina E, Katz JN, Bitton A. 2015. Comparison of Care Provided in Practices With Nurse Practitioners and Physician Assistants Versus Subspecialist Physicians Only: A Cohort Study of Rheumatoid Arthritis. *Arthritis Care Res (Hoboken)* 67: 1664-70



- 15. Ahluwalia V, Brooks S, Bell M, Cesta A, Kendzerska T, Sweezie R, Widdifield J, Fullerton L, Karasik A, Bombardier C. 2016. The Effect of Triage Assessments on Identifying Inflammatory Arthritis and Reducing Rheumatology Wait Times in Ontario: The ORA Allied Health Rheumatologist Triage (AHRT) Project. Arthritis Rheumatol 68
- 16. Martin L. 2015. Academic Alternative Relationship Plan at the University of Calgary. CRAJ 25: 12-3
- 17. Stewart JC, Teo MM. 2014. Rheumatology Perspectives: On Working With a Nurse. CRAJ 24: 15
- 18. Birch S, Kephart G, Murphy GT, O'Brien-Pallas L, Alder R, MacKenzie A. 2009. Health human resources planning and the production of health: development of an extended analytical framework for needsbased health human resources planning. *J Public Health Manag Pract* 15: S56-61
- 19. CanadianMedicalAssociation. 2018. Rheumatology profile, CMA, Ottawa
- 20. Widdifield J, Gatley JM, Pope JE, Barber CEH, Kuriya B, Eder L, Thorne C, Ling V, Paterson JM, Ahluwalia V, Marks C, Bernatsky S. 2021. Feminization of the Rheumatology Workforce: A Longitudinal Evaluation of Patient Volumes, Practice Sizes, and Physician Remuneration. *J Rheumatol* 48: 1090-7
- 21. Jorge A, Bolster M, Fu X, Blumenthal DM, Gross N, Blumenthal KG, Wallace Z. 2021. The Association Between Physician Gender and Career Advancement Among Academic Rheumatologists in the United States. *Arthritis Rheumatol* 73: 168-72
- 22. Kulhawy S, Widdifield J, C. B, Committeee CHR. 2021. CRA Workforce and Wellness Survey Results (forthcoming).
- 23. CMA. 2019. *Orthopedic Surgery Profile*, https://www.cma.ca/sites/default/files/2019-01/orthopedic-surgery-e.pdf
- 24. Cohen M, Kiran T. 2020. Closing the gender pay gap in Canadian medicine. CMAJ 192: E1011-E7
- 25. Reed DA, Enders F, Lindor R, McClees M, Lindor KD. 2011. Gender differences in academic productivity and leadership appointments of physicians throughout academic careers. *Acad Med* 86: 43-7
- 26. Ellinas EH, Best JA, Kowalski AM, Sharkey KM, Shillcutt SK, Al-Assi K, Silver JK. 2021. Representation of Women on Journal Editorial Boards Affiliated with the Association of American Medical College's Council of Faculty and Academic Societies. *J Womens Health (Larchmt)*
- 27. Larson AR, Poorman JA, Silver JK. 2019. Representation of Women Among Physician Authors of Perspective-Type Articles in High-Impact Dermatology Journals. *JAMA Dermatol* 155: 386-8
- 28. Silver JK, Poorman JA, Reilly JM, Spector ND, Goldstein R, Zafonte RD. 2018. Assessment of Women Physicians Among Authors of Perspective-Type Articles Published in High-Impact Pediatric Journals. JAMA Netw Open 1: e180802
- 29. Levinsky Y, Vardi Y, Gafner M, Cohen N, Mimouni M, Scheuerman O, Furst DE, Amarilyo G. 2021. Trend in women representation among authors of high rank rheumatology journals articles, 2002-2019. *Rheumatology (Oxford)*
- 30. Ruzycki SM, Fletcher S, Earp M, Bharwani A, Lithgow KC. 2019. Trends in the Proportion of Female Speakers at Medical Conferences in the United States and in Canada, 2007 to 2017. *JAMA Netw Open* 2: e192103
- 31. Burns KEA, Straus SE, Liu K, Rizvi L, Guyatt G. 2019. Gender differences in grant and personnel award funding rates at the Canadian Institutes of Health Research based on research content area: A retrospective analysis. *PLoS Med* 16: e1002935
- 32. Weng JK, Valle LF, Nam GE, Chu FI, Steinberg ML, Raldow AC. 2019. Evaluation of Sex Distribution of Industry Payments Among Radiation Oncologists. *JAMA Netw Open* 2: e187377



- 33. Morgan HK, Purkiss JA, Porter AC, Lypson ML, Santen SA, Christner JG, Grum CM, Hammoud MM. 2016. Student Evaluation of Faculty Physicians: Gender Differences in Teaching Evaluations. *J Womens Health* (*Larchmt*) 25: 453-6
- 34. Lorello GR, Silver JK, Moineau G, McCarthy K, Flexman AM. 2020. Trends in Representation of Female Applicants and Matriculants in Canadian Residency Programs Across Specialties, 1995 to 2019. *JAMA Netw Open* 3: e2027938
- 35. Menon A. 2020. Sexism and Sexual Harassment in Medicine: Unraveling the Web. *J Gen Intern Med* 35: 1302-3
- 36. Choo EK, van Dis J, Kass D. 2018. Time's Up for Medicine? Only Time Will Tell. N Engl J Med 379: 1592-3
- 37. French F, Andrew J, Awramenko M, Coutts H, Leighton-Beck L, Mollison J, Needham G, Scott A, Walker K. 2006. Why do work patterns differ between men and women GPs? *J Health Organ Manag* 20: 163-72
- 38. Franks P, Bertakis KD. 2003. Physician gender, patient gender, and primary care. *J Womens Health* (*Larchmt*) 12: 73-80
- 39. Bertakis KD, Franks P, Azari R. 2003. Effects of physician gender on patient satisfaction. *J Am Med Womens Assoc* (1972) 58: 69-75
- 40. Roter DL, Hall JA, Aoki Y. 2002. Physician gender effects in medical communication: a meta-analytic review. *JAMA* 288: 756-64
- 41. Frank E, Harvey LK. 1996. Prevention advice rates of women and men physicians. Arch Fam Med 5: 215-9
- 42. Henderson JT, Weisman CS. 2001. Physician gender effects on preventive screening and counseling: an analysis of male and female patients' health care experiences. *Med Care* 39: 1281-92
- 43. Baig AA, Heisler M. 2008. The Influence of Patient Race and Socioeconomic Status and Resident Physician Gender and Specialty on Preventive Screening. *Semin Med Pract* 11: 27-35
- 44. Baumhakel M, Muller U, Bohm M. 2009. Influence of gender of physicians and patients on guidelinerecommended treatment of chronic heart failure in a cross-sectional study. *Eur J Heart Fail* 11: 299-303
- 45. Berthold HK, Gouni-Berthold I, Bestehorn KP, Bohm M, Krone W. 2008. Physician gender is associated with the quality of type 2 diabetes care. *J Intern Med* 264: 340-50
- 46. Boesveld S. 2020. What's driving the gender pay gap in medicine? CMAJ 192: E19-E20
- 47. Ganguli I, Sheridan B, Gray J, Chernew M, Rosenthal MB, Neprash H. 2020. Physician Work Hours and the Gender Pay Gap Evidence from Primary Care. *N Engl J Med* 383: 1349-57
- 48. Barber CEH NM, Barnabe C, Badley EM, Lacaille D, Pope J, Cividino A, Yacyshyn E, Baillie C, Mosher D, Thomson JG, Charnock C, Thorne JC, Zummer M, Brophy J, Ruban TN, Ahluwalia V, McDougall R, Marshall DA. 2019. Planning for the rheumatologist workforce: factors associated with work hours and volumes. *J Clin Rheumatol* 25: 142-6
- 49. Battafarano DF, Ditmyer M, Bolster MB, Fitzgerald JD, Deal C, Bass AR, Molina R, Erickson AR, Hausmann JS, Klein-Gitelman M, Imundo LF, Smith BJ, Jones K, Greene K, Monrad SU. 2018. 2015 American College of Rheumatology Workforce Study: Supply and Demand Projections of Adult Rheumatology Workforce, 2015-2030. Arthritis Care Res (Hoboken) 70: 617-26
- 50. Hooker RS. 2008. The extension of rheumatology services with physician assistants and nurse practitioners. *Best Pract Res Clin Rheumatol* 22: 523-33
- 51. Solomon DH, Bitton A, Fraenkel L, Brown E, Tsao P, Katz JN. 2014. Roles of nurse practitioners and physician assistants in rheumatology practices in the US. *Arthritis Care Res (Hoboken)* 66: 1108-13
- 52. Rao AD, Nicholas SE, Kachniarz B, Hu C, Redmond KJ, Deville C, Wright JL, Page BR, Terezakis S, Viswanathan AN, DeWeese TL, Fivush BA, Alcorn SR. 2018. Association of a Simulated Institutional



- Gender Equity Initiative With Gender-Based Disparities in Medical School Faculty Salaries and Promotions. *JAMA Netw Open* 1: e186054
- 53. Kendall P. 2010. *Investing in Prevention: Improving health and creating sustainability: the Provincial Health Officer's special report*, Office of the Provincial Health Officer/British Columbia
- 54. Bourgeault I, Simkin S, Chamberland-Rowe C. 2019. Poor health workforce planning is costly, risky and inequitable. *CMAJ* 191: E1147-E8
- 55. Canadian Medical Association. Canadian Medical Association Masterfile.
- 56. Canadian Institute for Health Information. Scott's Medical Database metadata.
- 57. Canadian Resident Matching Service. Data & Reports.
- 58. Canadian Post-M.D. Education Registry. Census Data Tables.
- 59. British Columbia Medical Association. *Doctors today and tomorrow: Planning British Columbia's Physician Workforce*
- 60. Dejaco C, Putrik P, Unger J, Aletaha D, Bianchi G, Bijlsma JW, Boonen A, Cikes N, Finckh A, Gossec L, Kvien TK, Madruga Dias J, Matteson EL, Sivera F, Stamm TA, Szekanecz Z, Wiek D, Zink A, Ramiro S, Buttgereit F. 2018. EULAR 'points to consider' for the conduction of workforce requirement studies in rheumatology. *RMD Open* 4: e000780
- 61. Dejaco C, Lackner A, Buttgereit F, Matteson EL, Narath M, Sprenger M. 2016. Rheumatology Workforce Planning in Western Countries: A Systematic Literature Review. *Arthritis care & research* 68: 1874-82
- 62. Unger J, Putrik P, Buttgereit F, Aletaha D, Bianchi G, Bijlsma JWJ, Boonen A, Cikes N, Dias JM, Falzon L, Finckh A, Gossec L, Kvien TK, Matteson EL, Sivera F, Stamm TA, Szekanecz Z, Wiek D, Zink A, Dejaco C, Ramiro S. 2018. Workforce requirements in rheumatology: a systematic literature review informing the development of a workforce prediction risk of bias tool and the EULAR points to consider. RMD Open 4: e000756
- 63. Barber CE, Jewett L, Badley EM, Lacaille D, Cividino A, Ahluwalia V, Averns H, Baillie C, Ellsworth J, Pope J, Levy D, Charnock C, McGowan C, Thorne JC, Barnabe C, Zummer M, Lundon K, McDougall RS, Thomson JG, Yacyshyn EA, Mosher D, Brophy J, Ruban TN, Marshall DA. 2017. Stand Up and Be Counted: Measuring and Mapping the Rheumatology Workforce in Canada. *Journal of Rheumatology* 44: 248-57
- 64. Hanly J. 2010. Trends In Physician Resources And Trainees In Canadian Academic Rheumatology Centers Over 11 Years. *Journal of Rheumatology* 37: 1287-
- 65. Hanly J, Ccar. 2018. Physician Resources and Activities in Canadian Academic Rheumatology Units 1998-2017. *Journal of Rheumatology* 45: 1009-10
- 66. Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons Canada. 2019. *Specialty Workforce Collaborative: Update July 2019.*
- 67. Barber CE, Jewett L, Badley EM, Lacaille D, Cividino A, Ahluwalia V, Averns H, Baillie C, Ellsworth J, Pope J, Levy D, Charnock C, McGowan C, Thorne JC, Barnabe C, Zummer M, Lundon K, McDougall RS, Thomson JG, Yacyshyn EA, Mosher D, Brophy J, Ruban TN, Marshall DA. 2017. Stand Up and Be Counted: Measuring and Mapping the Rheumatology Workforce in Canada. *J Rheumatol* 44: 248-57
- 68. Royal College of Physicians. 2016-2017 census (UK consultants and higher specialty trainees).
- 69. Walsh AB, S. 2011. International Medical Graduates: Current Issues.
- 70. Curtis LJ, Dube U. 2015. Demographics, Debt, and Practice Intentions of Medical Residents Training in Canada. *Canadian Public Policy-Analyse De Politiques* 41: S138-S49
- 71. Najeeb U, Wong B, Hollenberg E, Stroud L, Edwards S, Kuper A. 2019. Moving beyond orientations: a multiple case study of the residency experiences of Canadian-born and immigrant international medical graduates. *Advances in Health Sciences Education* 24: 103-23



- 72. Canadian Federation of Medical Students. Canadian Medical Student Policy Statement on Recruitment of International Medical Graduates by Canadian Provinces.
- 73. Neiterman E, Bourgeault IL, Covell CL. 2017. What Do We Know and Not Know about the Professional Integration of International Medical Graduates (IMGs) in Canada? *Healthc Policy* 12: 18-32
- 74. Barber CE, Marshall DA, Mosher DP, Akhavan P, Tucker L, Houghton K, Batthish M, Levy DM, Schmeling H, Ellsworth J, Tibollo H, Grant S, Khodyakov D, Lacaille D, and the Arthritis Alliance of Canada Performance Measurement Development P. 2016. Development of System-level Performance Measures for Evaluation of Models of Care for Inflammatory Arthritis in Canada. *J Rheumatol*
- 75. Brophy J, Marshall DA, Badley EM, Hanly JG, Averns H, Ellsworth J, Pope JE, Barber CE. 2016. Measuring the Rheumatology Workforce in Canada: A Literature Review. *J Rheumatol* 43: 1121-9
- 76. Arksey H, O'Malley L. 2005. Scoping studies: towards a methodological framework. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology* 8: 19-32
- 77. Pham MT, Rajić A, Greig JD, Sargeant JM, Papadopoulos A, McEwen SA. 2014. A scoping review of scoping reviews: advancing the approach and enhancing the consistency. *Research Synthesis Methods* 5: 371-85
- 78. Cividino A, Bakowsky V, Barr S, Bessette L, Hazel E, Khalidi N, Pineau C, Pope J, Robinson D, Shojania K, Yacyshyn E, Lohfeld L, Crawshaw D. 2015. Training the Rheumatologists of Tomorrow: The Learners Experience. *Journal of Rheumatology* 42: 1284-5
- 79. Cividino A, Legault K, Barry C, Purvis J, Crawshaw D. 2017. Human Resources Committee's Subgroup-interpretation of Student Recruitment Activities. *Journal of Rheumatology* 44: 932-
- 80. Cividino A, Legault K, Pope J, Khalidi N, Rohekar S, Lohfeld L, Crawshaw D. 2015. Training the Rheumatologists of Tomorrow: The WOMAC Experience. *Journal of Rheumatology* 42: 1310-1
- 81. Jurencak R, Roth J, Lawrence S. 2012. Availability of Pediatric Rheumatology Training within Pediatric Residency Programs in Canada A Complete Report. *Journal of Rheumatology* 39: 1718-
- 82. Katz S. 2018. Attracting Internal Medicine Residents to Rheumatology: A 2018 Update. *Journal of Rheumatology* 45: 1044-
- 83. Katz SJ. 2013. Increasing Rheumatology Exposure To Internal Medicine Residents: 3 Year Analysis Of A Web-Based Image Of The Month. *Arthritis and Rheumatism* 65: S414-S
- 84. Legault K, Bakowsky V, Barr S, Hazel E, Nair B, Rohekar S, Shuckett R, Soo J, Yacyshyn E, Bernick J, Wong D, Purvis J, Charnock C, Lohfeld L, Crawshaw D, Cividino A. 2016. #MakeRheum for Rheumatology: Testing Novel Ways to Increase Interest in Rheumatology by Canadian Undergraduate and Postgraduate Medical Trainees. *Journal of Rheumatology* 43: 1165-
- 85. Miettunen P, Luca N, Benseler S, Ellsworth J, Gerschman T, Johnson N, Schmeling H, Shiff NJ. 2014. Advocating for Pediatric Rheumatology Care in the Mid-Canadian Provinces: Large Geographic Area, Large Pediatric Population, Low Number of Pediatric Rheumatologists and Allied Health Workers Identified As Unique Challenges. *Arthritis & Rheumatology* 66: S25-S6
- 86. Pope J, Hewitt S, Charnock C. 2015. A Review of Canadian Rheumatology Association Summer Studentships Demonstrates Positive Attitudes of Students for a Career in Rheumatology. *Journal of Rheumatology* 42: 1303-
- 87. Widdifield J, Bernatsky S, Ahluwalia V, Barber C, Eder L, Kuriya B, Ling V, Lyddiatt A, Paterson M, Pope J, Thorne C. 2018. Trends in encounters with rheumatologists in a publicly-funded single payer healthcare system. *Annals of the Rheumatic Diseases* 77: 834



- 88. Widdifield J, Bernatsky S, Ahluwalia V, Barber C, Eder L, Hofstetter C, Kuriya B, Ling V, Lyddiatt A, Paterson M, Pope J, Thorne C. 2018. Changes in the Ontario Rheumatology Workforce. *Journal of Rheumatology* 45: 1005-
- 89. Yelovich MC, Beattie K, Matsos M. 2018. Factors Affecting Consideration of a Career in Rheumatology by Internal Medicine Residents. *Journal of Rheumatology* 45: 985-
- 90. Katz S. 2012. Increasing Rheumatology Exposure to Internal Medicine Residents in the Setting of Limited Resources: Evaluation of A Web-Based Image of the Month. *Journal of Rheumatology* 39: 1744-
- 91. Matsos/Yelovich. Can't find ACR reference.
- 92. Widdifield J, Bernatsky S, Ahluwalia V, Barber C, Eder L, Hofstetter C, Kuriya B, Ling V, Lyddiatt A, Paterson M, Pope J, Thorne C. 2018. THU0653 Changes in rheumatology provision and practice in a publicly-funded single payer healthcare system. *Annals of the Rheumatic Diseases* 77: 521
- 93. Cividino A, Bakowsky V, Barr S, Bessette L, Khalidi N, Pineau CA, Pope JE, Robinson D, Shojania K, Yacyshyn E, Lohfeld L, Crawshaw D. 2014. Training the Rheumatologists of Tomorrow: The Canadian Experience. *Arthritis & Rheumatology* 66: S1260-S
- 94. Matsos M, Docherty-Skippen SM, Yelovich MC, Beattie KA. 2019. Factors that influence Canadian internal medicine residents' choice to pursue a rheumatology career. *Clinical Rheumatology* 38: 229-34
- 95. Cividino A, Bakowsky V, Barr S, Bessette L, Hazel E, Khalidi N, Pope J, Robinson D, Shojania K, Yacyshyn E, Lohfeld L, Crawshaw D. 2016. How to Attract Trainees, a Pan-Canadian Perspective: Phase 1 of the "Training the Rheumatologists of Tomorrow" Project. *Journal of Rheumatology* 43: 788-98
- 96. Barber CEH, Nasr M, Barnabe C, Badley EM, Lacaille D, Pope J, Cividino A, Yacyshyn E, Baillie C, Mosher D, Thomson JG, Charnock C, Thorne JC, Zummer M, Brophy J, Ruban TN, Ahluwalia V, McDougall R, Marshall DA. 2018. Planning for the Rheumatologist Workforce: Factors Associated With Work Hours and Volumes. *JCR: Journal of Clinical Rheumatology*: 25
- 97. Brophy J, Marshall DA, Badley EM, Hanly JG, Averns H, Ellsworth J, Pope JE, Barber CE. 2016. Measuring the Rheumatology Workforce in Canada: A Literature Review. *Journal of Rheumatology* 43: 1121-9
- 98. Harth M. 2017. Slow Advances in Supply of Canadian Rheumatologists. Journal of Rheumatology 44: 962
- 99. Johnston C. 2015. Rheumatology an in-demand career choice. *CMAJ Canadian Medical Association Journal* 187: E298
- 100. Katz SJ, Yacyshyn EA. 2009. Attracting internal medicine trainees to rheumatology: where and when programs should focus efforts. *Journal of Rheumatology* 36: 2802-5
- 101. Reveille JD, Munoz R, Soriano E, Albanese M, Espada G, Lozada CJ, Montufar RA, Neubarth F, Vasquez GM, Zummer M, Sheen R, Caballero-Uribe CV, Pineda C. 2016. Review of Current Workforce for Rheumatology in the Countries of the Americas 2012-2015. *JCR: Journal of Clinical Rheumatology* 22: 405-10
- 102. Widdifield J, Paterson JM, Bernatsky S, Tu K, Thorne JC, Ahluwalia V, Ivers N, Butt D, Jaakkimainen RL, Tomlinson G, Bombardier C. 2013. The rising burden of rheumatoid arthritis surpasses rheumatology supply in Ontario. *Canadian Journal of Public Health. Revue Canadienne de Sante Publique* 104: e450-5
- 103. Zborovski S, Rohekar G, Rohekar S. 2010. Strategies to improve recruitment into rheumatology: results of the Workforce in Rheumatology Issues Study (WRIST). *Journal of Rheumatology* 37: 1749-55
- 104. Wendling D, Lukas C, Prati C, Claudepierre P, Gossec L, Goupille P, Hudry C, Miceli-Richard C, Molto A, Pham T, Saraux A, Dougados M. 2018. 2018 update of French Society for Rheumatology (SFR) recommendations about the everyday management of patients with spondyloarthritis. *Joint Bone Spine* 85: 275-84



- 105. van der Heijde D, Ramiro S, Landewe R, Baraliakos X, Van den Bosch F, Sepriano A, Regel A, Ciurea A, Dagfinrud H, Dougados M, van Gaalen F, Geher P, van der Horst-Bruinsma I, Inman RD, Jongkees M, Kiltz U, Kvien TK, Machado PM, Marzo-Ortega H, Molto A, Navarro-Compan V, Ozgocmen S, Pimentel-Santos FM, Reveille J, Rudwaleit M, Sieper J, Sampaio-Barros P, Wiek D, Braun J. 2017. 2016 update of the ASAS-EULAR management recommendations for axial spondyloarthritis. *Ann Rheum Dis* 76: 978-91
- 106. Smolen JS, Landewe R, Bijlsma J, Burmester G, Chatzidionysiou K, Dougados M, Nam J, Ramiro S, Voshaar M, van Vollenhoven R, Aletaha D, Aringer M, Boers M, Buckley CD, Buttgereit F, Bykerk V, Cardiel M, Combe B, Cutolo M, van Eijk-Hustings Y, Emery P, Finckh A, Gabay C, Gomez-Reino J, Gossec L, Gottenberg JE, Hazes JMW, Huizinga T, Jani M, Karateev D, Kouloumas M, Kvien T, Li Z, Mariette X, McInnes I, Mysler E, Nash P, Pavelka K, Poor G, Richez C, van Riel P, Rubbert-Roth A, Saag K, da Silva J, Stamm T, Takeuchi T, Westhovens R, de Wit M, van der Heijde D. 2017. EULAR recommendations for the management of rheumatoid arthritis with synthetic and biological disease-modifying antirheumatic drugs: 2016 update. *Ann Rheum Dis* 76: 960-77
- 107. SIGN. 2011. Management of early rheumatoid arthritis: a national clinical guideline (123)
- 108. NICE. 2017. Spondyloarthritis in over 16s: diagnosis and management
- 109. Keeling SO, Alabdurubalnabi Z, Avina-Zubieta A, Barr S, Bergeron L, Bernatsky S, Bourre-Tessier J, Clarke A, Baril-Dionne A, Dutz J, Ensworth S, Fifi-Mah A, Fortin PR, Gladman DD, Haaland D, Hanly JG, Hiraki LT, Hussein S, Legault K, Levy D, Lim L, Matsos M, McDonald EG, Medina-Rosas J, Pardo Pardi J, Peschken C, Pineau C, Pope J, Rader T, Reynolds J, Silverman E, Tselios K, Suitner M, Urowitz M, Touma Z, Vinet E, Santesso N. 2018. Canadian Rheumatology Association Recommendations for the Assessment and Monitoring of Systemic Lupus Erythematosus. *J Rheumatol* 45: 1426-39
- 110. Holroyd CR, Seth R, Bukhari M, Malaviya A, Holmes C, Curtis E, Chan C, Yusuf MA, Litwic A, Smolen S, Topliffe J, Bennett S, Humphreys J, Green M, Ledingham J. 2019. The British Society for Rheumatology biologic DMARD safety guidelines in inflammatory arthritis. *Rheumatology (Oxford)* 58: e3-e42
- 111. Gossec L, Smolen JS, Ramiro S, de Wit M, Cutolo M, Dougados M, Emery P, Landewe R, Oliver S, Aletaha D, Betteridge N, Braun J, Burmester G, Canete JD, Damjanov N, FitzGerald O, Haglund E, Helliwell P, Kvien TK, Lories R, Luger T, Maccarone M, Marzo-Ortega H, McGonagle D, McInnes IB, Olivieri I, Pavelka K, Schett G, Sieper J, van den Bosch F, Veale DJ, Wollenhaupt J, Zink A, van der Heijde D. 2016. European League Against Rheumatism (EULAR) recommendations for the management of psoriatic arthritis with pharmacological therapies: 2015 update. *Ann Rheum Dis* 75: 499-510
- 112. Gaujoux-Viala C, Gossec L, Cantagrel A, Dougados M, Fautrel B, Mariette X, Nataf H, Saraux A, Trope S, Combe B. 2014. Recommendations of the French Society for Rheumatology for managing rheumatoid arthritis. *Joint Bone Spine* 81: 287-97
- 113. Combe B, Landewe R, Daien CI, Hua C, Aletaha D, Alvaro-Gracia JM, Bakkers M, Brodin N, Burmester GR, Codreanu C, Conway R, Dougados M, Emery P, Ferraccioli G, Fonseca J, Raza K, Silva-Fernandez L, Smolen JS, Skingle D, Szekanecz Z, Kvien TK, van der Helm-van Mil A, van Vollenhoven R. 2017. 2016 update of the EULAR recommendations for the management of early arthritis. *Ann Rheum Dis* 76: 948-59
- 114. Cellucci T, Guzman J, Petty RE, Batthish M, Benseler SM, Ellsworth JE, Houghton KM, Le BC, Huber AM, Luca N, Schmeling H, Shiff NJ, Soon GS, Tse SM. 2016. Management of Juvenile Idiopathic Arthritis 2015: A Position Statement from the Pediatric Committee of the Canadian Rheumatology Association. *J Rheumatol* 43: 1773-6
- 115. Albrecht K, Kruger K, Wollenhaupt J, Alten R, Backhaus M, Baerwald C, Bolten W, Braun J, Burkhardt H, Burmester GR, Gaubitz M, Gause A, Gromnica-Ihle E, Kellner H, Kuipers J, Krause A, Lorenz HM, Manger



- B, Nusslein H, Pott HG, Rubbert-Roth A, Schneider M, Specker C, Schulze-Koops H, Tony HP, Wassenberg S, Muller-Ladner U. 2014. German guidelines for the sequential medical treatment of rheumatoid arthritis with traditional and biologic disease-modifying antirheumatic drugs. *Rheumatol Int* 34: 1-9
- 116. Arthritis Alliance of Canada. 2014. A pan-Canadian Approach to Inflammatory Arthritis Models of Care
- 117. Cellucci T, Guzman J, Petty RE, Batthish M, Benseler SM, Ellsworth JE, Houghton KM, Le BC, Huber AM, Luca N, Schmeling H, Shiff NJ, Soon GS, Tse SM, Pediatric Committee of the Canadian Rheumatology A. 2016. Management of Juvenile Idiopathic Arthritis 2015: A Position Statement from the Pediatric Committee of the Canadian Rheumatology Association. *J Rheumatol* 43: 1773-6
- 118. Fitzcharles MA, Ste-Marie PA, Goldenberg DL, Pereira JX, Abbey S, Choiniere M, Ko G, Moulin DE, Panopalis P, Proulx J, Shir Y, National Fibromyalgia Guideline Advisory P. 2013. 2012 Canadian Guidelines for the diagnosis and management of fibromyalgia syndrome: executive summary. *Pain Res Manag* 18: 119-26
- 119. Smolen JS, Landewe R, Breedveld FC, Buch M, Burmester G, Dougados M, Emery P, Gaujoux-Viala C, Gossec L, Nam J, Ramiro S, Winthrop K, de Wit M, Aletaha D, Betteridge N, Bijlsma JW, Boers M, Buttgereit F, Combe B, Cutolo M, Damjanov N, Hazes JM, Kouloumas M, Kvien TK, Mariette X, Pavelka K, van Riel PL, Rubbert-Roth A, Scholte-Voshaar M, Scott DL, Sokka-Isler T, Wong JB, van der Heijde D. 2014. EULAR recommendations for the management of rheumatoid arthritis with synthetic and biological disease-modifying antirheumatic drugs: 2013 update. *Ann Rheum Dis* 73: 492-509
- 120. Holroyd CR, Seth R, Bukhari M, Malaviya A, Holmes C, Curtis E, Chan C, Yusuf MA, Litwic A, Smolen S, Topliffe J, Bennett S, Humphreys J, Green M, Ledingham J. 2019. The British Society for Rheumatology biologic DMARD safety guidelines in inflammatory arthritis. *Rheumatology (Oxford)* 58: 372
- 121. 2017. In Spondyloarthritis in over 16s: diagnosis and management. London
- 122. SIGN. 2011. Management of early rheumatoid arthritis, Edinburgh
- 123. Gaujoux-Viala C, Gossec L, Cantagrel A, Dougados M, Fautrel B, Mariette X, Nataf H, Saraux A, Trope S, Combe B, French Society for R. 2014. Recommendations of the French Society for Rheumatology for managing rheumatoid arthritis. *Joint Bone Spine* 81: 287-97
- 124. ACR. 2013. White Paper: Rheumatic Diseases in America, The Problem. The Impact. The answers.
- 125. ACR. 2015. The Rheumatologist as Principal Care Physician: Policy Statement. ed. ACO RHEUMATOLOGY